

F.O.
371

6/13/3

CLOSED UNTIL
1989

135484

1958

Z

Permanent Under-Secretary's Department

Z E 12/105

ATOMIC ENERGY

FROM
I.A.E.A.

International Atomic Energy Agency - Board of Governors.
Omnibus jacket of official records of meetings.

NoG VARIOUS.

Dated

Received in
Registry— 12 March, 1958.

References to former relevant papers

MINUTES

A)

GOV/OR.34: dated 3 March, 1958. ✓

B) GOV/OR.35: dated 5 March, 1958. ✓

MS 13/3

C) GOV/OR 36 dated 7 March 1958

D) GOV/OR 37 dated 10 March 1958

E) GOV/OR 38 dated 10 March 1958

F) GOV/OR 39 dated 11 March 1958

MS
RUB

(Print)

(How disposed of)

(Action completed)

BAO. 17/6

(Index)

29
17/2/59

References to later relevant papers

Z E 12/121

**INTERNATIONAL
ATOMIC ENERGY AGENCY**

A6
ZENTEN

Z

Distr.
RESTRICTED
GOV/OR.39
11 March 1958
ENGLISH

Board of Governors

THIS DOCUMENT IS CIRCULATED TO MEMBERS OF THE AGENCY FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

OFFICIAL RECORD OF THE THIRTY-NINTH MEETING

Held at the Musikakademie, Vienna,
on Friday, 17 January 1958, at 3.15 p.m.

RECEIVED IN
ARCHIVES
14 MAR 1958

ZE12/105^F

CONTENTS

<u>Agenda item*</u>		<u>Paragraphs</u>
8	The question of the establishment of a standing scientific advisory council (continued)	1 - 12
4	The Agency's initial fellowship programme: (a) Solicitation of voluntary contributions; and (b) Consideration of offers to provide fellowships and facilities	13 - 114
9	Preliminary report on arrangements for the Agency's participation in the second International Conference on the Peaceful Uses of Atomic Energy	115 - 118
-	Order of business	119

* See document GOV/INF/13.

Present

Mr. WINKLER	Chairman
Mr. E.T. PARDO	Argentina
Mr. PULLEY	Australia
Mr. BERNARDES	Brazil
Mr. WERSHOF	Canada
Mr. BRÁZDA	Czechoslovakia
Mr. FAHMY	Egypt
Mr. GOLDSCHMIDT	France
Mr. QUINONES	Guatemala
Mr. RAJAN	India
Mr. SURJOTJONDRO	Indonesia
Mr. d'ORLANDI	Italy
Mr. FURUUCHI	Japan
Mr. HAN	Republic of Korea
Mr. AHMAD	Pakistan
Mr. SOSA PARDO	Peru
Mr. FONTES	Portugal
Mr. NOVACU	Romania
Mr. ALLARD	Sweden
Mr. HOLMQUIST	
Mr. INAN	Turkey
Mr. SOLE	Union of South Africa
Mr. EMELYANOV	Union of Soviet Socialist Republics
Mr. MICHAELS	United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland
Mr. McKINNEY	United States of America
<hr/>	
Mr. DOLLINGER	Representative of the Secretary-General of the United Nations
<hr/>	
Mr. COLE	Director General
Mr. JOLLES	Deputy Director General for Administration, Liaison and Secretariat
Mr. MIGULIN	Deputy Director General for Training and Information
Mr. BOLTON	Secretary of the Board

ITEM 8: THE QUESTION OF THE ESTABLISHMENT OF A STANDING SCIENTIFIC ADVISORY COUNCIL (GOV/86) (continued)

1. Mr. WERSHOF (Canada) hoped that the Board's discussion of item 8 could be terminated almost immediately. It was open to any Governor to propose items for inclusion in the agenda of the March series of meetings, and the Board itself could alter that agenda in any way it saw fit at its opening meeting in March.
2. Mr. NOVACU (Romania) had not intended to speak again on item 8 but, in view of the discussion that had taken place, he wished to clarify his delegation's attitude on some points. He was, incidentally, grateful to the Governors from France^{1/} and the Soviet Union^{2/}, who had cleared up some points raised in the communication from Romania (GOV/86).
3. The proposed scientific advisory council should meet two or three times a year to discuss major problems. In that way continuity would be ensured and the Agency would have the assistance of the most highly competent specialists available. He did not share the opinion of the Director General^{3/} and that of the Governor from the United States^{4/} with regard to the role the Secretariat might play. According to the Statute, the Secretariat was a purely executive organ and the Board of Governors was not empowered to entrust it with other functions.
4. He did not think there would be any substantial difference in the financial implications if ad hoc panels were convened instead of an advisory council.
5. He therefore wished to propose that the Board should request the Secretariat to draw up documents of the kind asked for during the previous meeting and present **them** later.

1/ See official record of the thirty-eighth meeting (GOV/OR.38), paragraphs 7-13.

2/ Ibid., paragraphs 27-30 and 53-57.

3/ Ibid., paragraphs 66-69.

4/ Ibid., paragraphs 60-65 and 72.

6. Mr. ALLARD (Sweden) said that to make the position of his delegation perfectly clear he would read out the following formal draft proposal:

"The Swedish delegation proposes that the Board decides to charge the Secretariat to undertake a study and prepare the necessary papers in order to show the advantages or disadvantages of either the establishment of a standing scientific advisory council or to convene, when need arises, ad hoc panels of specialists to provide scientific advice on particular aspects of the agency's programme.

"The Swedish delegation further proposes that the decision of the Board on the question mentioned under item 8 of the agenda be deferred until this study is finished and the papers prepared by the Secretariat have been submitted to the Board."

7. Mr. FURUUCHI (Japan) understood from the Chairman's summing-up at the previous meeting^{5/} that it had actually been decided to set up a standing scientific advisory council. His delegation believed that such a council would not be required. He shared the opinion of the Director General that there would be enough staff members with first-class qualifications to make outside advice unnecessary, except on rare occasions.^{6/} The organizational framework should be as simple as possible. He had no objection to further study of the subject by the Secretariat.

8. Mr. HAN (Republic of Korea) felt that, for the time being at any rate, the establishment of a scientific advisory council was not justified. The Board could obtain expert technical advice from the Agency's staff, supplemented where necessary by advice from ad hoc panels.

9. Mr. PARDO (Argentina) hoped the Board would decide to instruct the Secretariat to study both questions: a standing scientific advisory council, and ad hoc technical panels.

^{5/} Ibid., paragraphs 70 and 71.

^{6/} Ibid., paragraph 68.

10. The CHAIRMAN, referring to the remarks of the Governor from Japan, wished to make it quite clear that nothing in what he had said at the previous meeting should be taken to imply that a decision had been made that a standing scientific advisory council was to be established. No such council could be set up until the Board had agreed on its essential features, and that could not be done until a proper study had been completed.

11. The Board had before it a suggestion by the Governor from Romania that the Director General be requested to prepare the documents asked for by Governors during the discussion. The Governor from Sweden had made a formal proposal which it might be possible to merge with the suggestion of the Governor from Romania; he thought, incidentally, that there was some inconsistency between the first and second parts of the Swedish proposal. The Governor from Argentina had suggested that both questions referred to in the Swedish proposal should be studied.

12. The discussion which had taken place had been thorough enough to provide the Director General with guidance on all the issues raised. He therefore suggested that the Director General be asked to prepare the papers and studies requested by Governors and submit them for consideration later.

It was so agreed.

ITEM 4: THE AGENCY'S INITIAL FELLOWSHIP PROGRAMME

- (a) SOLICITATION OF VOLUNTARY CONTRIBUTIONS; AND
- (b) CONSIDERATION OF OFFERS TO PROVIDE FELLOWSHIPS AND FACILITIES (GOV/87, GOV/89 and GOV/90)

13. Mr. MIGULIN (Deputy Director General for Training and Information) said that the Secretariat's ideas on the initial fellowship programme were set out in the memorandum (GOV/87), which began with a statement taken from the Report of the Preparatory Commission that assistance in respect of exchange and training should be a major activity of the Agency in its initial years. The importance of the item had been stressed by the Governor from the Union of South Africa and by the Chairman, and was strongly emphasized in the programme recommended by the Preparatory Commission

(paragraphs 75 to 79). Broadly speaking, the training programme would be based on offers made by certain Members and needs stated by others. It was very gratifying to note that offers had already been made; others would no doubt follow.

14. The memorandum listed a number of points on which data were required before the Agency could form a proper estimate of requirements. Once the requests had been checked, it would be for the Agency to find ways and means of satisfying them. That could be done by following up the offers already made, by financing projects from the General Fund and, possibly, by assistance which might be made available through the United Nations. So far as the General Fund was concerned, no voluntary contributions had as yet been received.

15. The memorandum did not refer specifically to the regional training facilities mentioned in paragraph 79 of the Report of the Preparatory Commission. As the Board would remember, however, the Governor from Brazil had made a formal proposal that the question of establishing a regional training centre in Latin America be studied^{7/}; that proposal should receive careful attention.

16. Certain matters were referred to in the memorandum which did not relate directly to the initial fellowship programme but had a bearing on it.

17. Mr. JOLLES (Deputy Director General for Administration, Liaison and Secretariat) observed that item 4 was divided into two separate parts. He was personally concerned with the first: solicitation of voluntary contributions. The relevant section of the memorandum was paragraph 6. At that moment, the total of the fellowship fund stood at precisely US \$2.01.^{8/}

^{7/} See official record of the thirty-sixth meeting (GOV/OR.36), paragraph 70.

^{8/} See official record of the thirty-second meeting (GOV/OR.32), paragraphs 96 and 97.

18. Presumably the normal procedure would be followed of sending a circular letter to Member States, asking for contributions in accordance with the General Conference resolution^{9/}; that appeal would no doubt be supplemented by Governors who would raise the matter personally with their Governments. Before the Secretariat could send such a letter, however, some points had to be clarified. Should an indication be given, for example, of the form which contributions should take? Presumably they should be in cash, since the very name General Fund presupposed money. Secondly, the Statute made it quite clear that contributions of materials to the Agency could not be accompanied by conditions earmarking them for particular purposes. There was no such specific reference to contributions to the General Fund, but to attach conditions seemed incompatible with the idea of a General Fund. Thirdly, it seemed necessary to specify that, so far as possible, contributions should be made in a convertible currency; if that were not feasible they should at least be partially convertible.

19. Mr. INAN (Turkey) said that he had already spoken on the general subject of fellowships^{10/} and would at that stage confine himself to some specific points in the memorandum.

20. In connexion with paragraph 5, an annex listing the countries which had offered the 110 fellowships mentioned would be very useful. Were the latest offers by the Soviet Union and Romania included in that figure? Which were the sixteen States prepared to offer facilities for the training of nationals of other States? Had they actually made offers? What were the approximate total figures for the 1958 programme?

21. A statement of the general principles on which fellowships would be offered would also be helpful. Would the candidates be chosen by Governments or directly by the Agency? The far-reaching survey proposed by the Secretariat might provide useful information, but it could easily prevent the programme from starting in 1958,

^{9/} See Resolution adopted on 22 October 1957 (GC.1(S)/RES/6).

^{10/} See official record of the thirty-sixth meeting (GOV/OR.36) paragraphs 71-76.

although he believed there was general agreement that it should be put in hand before the winter academic term and before the second session of the General Conference.

22. The Secretariat should bear in mind the two extensive surveys which had recently been made in European countries, dealing respectively with the number of scientific staff engaged on work connected with atomic energy and with teaching establishments in the countries concerned.

23. Mr. MICHAELS (United Kingdom) wished to refer to some implications of the remarks made by the Deputy Director General for Administration, Liaison and Secretariat. He believed that the wording of the General Conference resolution left no doubt that contributions to the General Fund should be in money, which would be at the free disposal of the Agency. He had been somewhat disturbed to note certain offers already made which it would not be unfair to describe as contributions in kind, although they were expressed in terms of their monetary value. It might be misleading, and could give rise to serious difficulties, if the two concepts were not kept quite separate, as had in fact been done in item 4 as set out in the agenda. The Agency must obviously welcome all offers of places in training institutes, particularly if they were accompanied by an offer of a money contribution to the General Fund. Offers of free places, whether or not confined to particular institutions, fell into a different category and were quite distinct from places to be provided out of the General Fund.

24. He wished to refer to the last sentence of paragraph 73 of the Report of the Preparatory Commission, reading: "The Agency should in any event organize and help to finance a limited fellowship programme of its own". That stipulation had been made to allow the Agency a free choice of places of training and likewise to leave students free, so far as possible, to select the establishments to which they wished to go. Paragraph 4 of the memorandum was equally explicit. If the Agency had no General Fund out of which a programme could be financed, there would be almost insuperable difficulties in matching offers and requests.

25. He wished to make the position of his delegation clear. The United Kingdom did not propose to offer free places in educational establishments. It was prepared to contribute the sterling equivalent of \$25,000 to the General Fund without attaching any conditions as to how or where the money should be spent. That offer was obviously subject to the understanding that other Members made similar cash contributions to the General Fund and that all such contributions should be used solely for the provision of fellowships awarded by the Agency itself.

26. He fully sympathized with countries which would find it difficult to make cash contributions because of currency complications. As most countries would at some time contribute to the Fund and benefit from it, however, the actual margin to be covered by a currency transfer might in fact be very small.

27. He wished again to emphasize the absolute necessity of giving the Agency full freedom of choice, otherwise dissatisfaction would be bound to arise. An analogy could be drawn with arrangements made under the Expanded Programme of Technical Assistance and he hoped that the Secretariat would submit a draft of the rules for the administration of the fellowships under the Agency Fund.

28. Paragraph 7 of the memorandum visualized a kind of questionnaire; he personally rather disliked questionnaires. Some of the questions would be very difficult to answer in the United Kingdom. With regard to sub-paragraph (a), for example, he thought figures would take a long time to prepare and might be misleading. In fact, the United Kingdom probably trained proportionately more foreign students than any other country. Many students were already receiving training in atomic energy developments and it might be much easier for the United Kingdom to offer to accommodate students at the Agency's request on a purely practical basis as cases arose rather than attempt to state the total number that could be accommodated when many of those places were earmarked under existing arrangements.

29. Again, information could be supplied on the lines indicated in sub-paragraphs (b) and (c) but the number of institutions and the variety of training courses were such that the lists would require almost endless qualification. He saw the advantage of putting those questions to countries which had a relatively limited number of educational establishments and courses, but in countries like the United Kingdom it might be simpler to treat the matter on a pragmatic basis. Perhaps a small working party could discuss that and related matters with the Deputy Director General for Training and Information. On some of the points his country could provide the data required.

30. He had hoped the Board would be able to inform the General Conference in 1958 that the Agency already had solid achievements, in training and in other activities, to its credit. It was desirable that voluntary contributions to the General Fund should be made at an early date and that any free places to be placed at the disposal of the Agency should be offered in addition to contributions to the General Fund. He hoped it would be made perfectly clear in any documents to be circulated to Member States that two separate concepts were involved, and that voluntary contributions, as indicated in item 4 (a) of the agenda, referred specifically to cash contributions.

31. Mr. McKINNEY (United States of America) said that his delegation considered the training of scientists to be one of the most urgent tasks facing the Agency in its early years. The Agency should do everything in its power to help to remedy the world-wide shortage of atomic specialists with as little delay as possible, and he hoped that the Director General would be able to give priority to the formation of the Agency's training division so that it might make an early start to that end.

32. The importance of providing training and assistance was widely recognized, and many generous offers had already been made by various Member States. In particular, the fellowship fund established by the General Conference would have a very important part to play and, as that fund was dependent on voluntary contributions, he hoped that subscriptions would soon start to

come in. The United States Government had agreed, as an indication of its continued concern for the successful implementation of the programme, to contribute the amount of \$125,000, i.e. fifty per cent of the fund, provided that the remainder was forthcoming from other contributors on a comparable basis.

33. In addition, the United States Government would offer approximately 120 fellowships over the coming two years for training in the nuclear sciences in institutions in the United States. The grants envisaged would cover maintenance, transport and tuition expenses.

34. The United States was ready to admit fifteen to twenty such students in time to begin their training by September 1958. The remainder would be accepted for the following academic year.

35. It was estimated that the proposed contribution to the fellowship fund and the value of the 120 fellowships would amount to a total of approximately \$965,000.

36. He would like to point out - particularly for the information of countries benefiting from the existing bilateral scientific training programmes - that the offer he had outlined would be additional to those programmes, not at their expense.

37. It was his earnest hope that all Member States with nuclear science training facilities at their disposal would find it possible to make a similar effort to overcome the serious deficiencies in manpower trained to develop atomic energy. In that connexion, he wished to put on record his appreciation of the generous offer just made by the Governor from the United Kingdom, and the offers from the Governors from the Union of Soviet Socialist Republics and Romania contained in the letters already circulated to the Board.

38. A letter would be sent in due course to the Director General by the United States delegation, setting forth in formal terms the conditions of the offer just made.

39. Mr. EMELYANOV (Union of Soviet Socialist Republics) said that, in the view of his delegation, the Agency had reached a stage at which the inauguration of a practical work programme was imperative. One very important aspect of its activities was the provision of training facilities for less-developed countries, which would otherwise continue to be excluded from participation in the achievements of atomic science.

40. Since the Agency's inception, the Soviet Union had devoted special attention to the need for national training programmes, and at the first session of the General Conference it had made a number of specific offers^{11/} providing for advanced training of the nationals of other Member States in its own educational and other institutions. In particular, it had undertaken to make available places for fifty to one hundred students at the request of Member States and, in addition, to provide fifty fellowships to students from less-advanced countries.

41. He had now been authorized to state on behalf of the Soviet Government that practical effect would be given to those offers of training during the 1958-1959 academic year. Details of the offers were set forth in an official communication contained in document GOV/89, which had already been circulated to members of the Board.

42. The Soviet Union delegation hoped that, on the basis of those and other offers already communicated to the Agency, it would be possible for the latter to start on its practical activities in the very near future.

43. In his view, the fellowship programme should consist of two quite separate parts. First of all, a programme should be drawn up for the allocation of fellowships in 1958, for which purpose it would be necessary to find out how many places the Agency could count on and in which branches of study. As soon as it became available, that information should be communicated to Member States with the request that they indicate without delay how many and what types of students they were proposing for training.

^{11/} See official record of the ninth plenary meeting(GC.1(S)/OR.9) paragraph 40.

44. Paragraph 7 of the Secretariat memorandum on the Agency's initial fellowship programme stated that:

"A work programme embracing the granting of fellowships, the exchange of experts and the provision of different types of training for variously qualified personnel can be drawn up only after replies to the following questions have been received from Member States".

The memorandum then went on to list a large number of questions in some detail.

45. For the requirements of an immediate practical programme, many of the points raised in the questionnaire were out of place, since they were not always directly relevant and, in any event, they would take a great deal of time and labour to answer. For the time being, therefore, a simpler and more direct approach would be preferable, investigations being confined to the points he had just mentioned.

46. The second part of the programme would be a long-term one, and should be concerned mainly with the training of young post-graduate scientists. For that purpose, a more detailed enquiry might be required to obtain exact information about the types of training required and the opportunities available in various countries.

47. A further programme might possibly be considered, to cover the training of the technicians who would be responsible for operating the extremely complicated and delicate equipment required in atomic industrial processes. Any such programme would have to depend partly on the exchange of scientists among Member States and, in that connexion also, full particulars would be needed before any comprehensive long-term plan could be drawn up.

48. Consideration should also be given to questions arising in connexion with the preparation of the textbooks and other educational material needed to facilitate specialist training schemes, and a programme should be worked out so that gaps in knowledge of certain subjects - as, for instance, nuclear physics and radio-chemistry - could be filled, and full use made of the special experience in different branches acquired by individual countries or institutions.

49. The Agency should in all circumstances, however, maintain a clear distinction between its immediate and longer-term programmes and should not attempt to apply the criteria for one category to the other, or allow its short-term programmes to be jeopardized by insisting on the preliminary collection of inapplicable or over-elaborate data.

50. Mr. SOLE (Union of South Africa) referred to the three points raised by the Deputy Director General for Administration, Liaison and Secretariat in connexion with the solicitation of voluntary contributions. He had no doubt, firstly, that the fellowship fund was intended to be a cash fund; secondly, it would be contrary to the principles set forth in the Statute to attach conditions earmarking contributions for particular purposes; and thirdly, while Governments should be invited to make their offers in convertible currencies, that should not be made an absolute condition.

51. With regard to the offers to provide fellowships and facilities, he thought the Board should decide what it was going to do in the immediate future, and also draw up a more complete fellowship programme for 1959.

52. The Secretariat should obtain as much information as possible from countries which had made offers - and also from individual Governors - about the proposed facilities: duration of courses, where they would be held, and so on. That information should be circulated as a matter of urgency to all Member Governments, without waiting for the completion of the more comprehensive questionnaire suggested in the memorandum: the Secretariat should at the same time inform the Governments of the procedure to be followed in applying for the fellowships offered. The Governments should in turn pass the information on at once to universities and similar institutions which might have candidates to propose for the fellowships.

53. He welcomed the offers made by the Governors from the United States and the Soviet Union, and hoped other countries would also find it possible to offer fellowships before the end of the current year.

54. The 1959 programme of fellowships could follow the lines just indicated by the Deputy Director General for Training and Information. **An attempt** should be made to find out the number of places Member States were likely to request, and the number of candidates they would propose for training.

55. He did not think the time had yet come to comment in detail on paragraph 7 of the memorandum. As no matters of policy would be involved, the simplest course might be to lay down certain guiding lines for the proposed questionnaire. After preparing a preliminary draft, the Secretariat could then seek further guidance whenever necessary from Governors who might be present in Vienna between the different series of meetings of the Board.

56. The Governor from the Soviet Union had referred to the long-term training programme, and he agreed with him that for the present there were too many intangible factors involved; the Board would be unable to reach even the most general conclusions until it had seen how the restricted programme - involving for the moment the fifteen to twenty fellowships offered by the United States in 1958 - and the broader 1959 programme would work out in practice.

57. Mr. RAJAN (India) had certain comments to make on the question of voluntary contributions and the other issues raised by the Deputy Director General for Administration, Liaison and Secretariat.

58. Resolution C on voluntary contributions, which had been contained in the report of the Preparatory Commission and adopted at the first session of the General Conference^{12/}, merely authorized the Board of Governors to accept voluntary contributions made in accordance with the Statute. The latter had only one reference to voluntary contributions, namely, Article XIV.F, which stated

^{12/} See official record of the eleventh plenary meeting (GC.1(S)/OR.11) paragraph 19.

simply that any voluntary contributions to the Agency were to be placed in the General Fund to be used as the Board of Governors determined. No practical guidance was given by either document. Furthermore, paragraph 4 of resolution C provided that the Board of Governors should submit rules governing the acceptance of voluntary contributions to the second session of the General Conference, so that the matter was still open.

59. In the meantime, the Board had to lay down certain principles or rules on the basis of which voluntary contributions could be placed in the General Fund and utilized. Those principles might well be those suggested at the beginning of the discussion by the Deputy Director General for Administration, Liaison and Secretariat^{13/}.

60. However desirable full convertibility might be, many countries wishing to make contributions might be unable to do so in convertible currencies. Certain exchange operations might be possible, but he doubted if the arrangement suggested by the Governor from the United Kingdom would work out in practice.

61. The same Governor had also referred to the need to make a distinction between voluntary contributions and offers of other kinds. His own delegation appreciated all offers, of whatever kind, and thought that they should be noted with appreciation by the Board.

62. He was inclined to agree that some of the individual questions suggested for inclusion in the proposed questionnaire might be very difficult to answer. For example, sub-paragraph (g), asking information about the kind of training individual States wished to carry out with the assistance of other countries and about their own training programmes, would take a very long time to answer in any useful way. Similarly, the information requested in sub-paragraph (h) could not very well be provided unless each country knew a great deal more about the requirements of the others and also knew what practical arrangements were feasible.

^{13/} See paragraphs 17 and 18 supra.

63. He would therefore be inclined to leave detailed drafting to the Secretariat and to suggest that the Agency should go ahead with a short-term programme, without waiting until the questionnaire was complete or an integrated fellowship programme was ready. The Agency had received enough offers to permit an immediate start. All information concerning offers should now be communicated as soon as possible to Member States, with a request to make their requirements known without delay.
64. Mr. d'ORLANDI (Italy) said he had been very happy to learn of the generous offers already made to make cash contributions and reserve places for foreign students.
65. For technical and budgetary reasons, the Italian Government had not so far been able to send the Director General details of its own fellowship offer. As a provisional indication he might say, however, that the Italian Government hoped to provide about ten million lire - the equivalent of \$16,000 - for ten fellowships, to be placed at the disposal of the Agency; the latter would be asked to select the individual students.
66. In cases where university laboratories and other scientific institutions imposed a statutory limitation on the number of fellowships that could be held at any given time, the Italian Government would be pleased to consult with the Agency with a view to reserving certain of those fellowships for candidates approved by the Agency.
67. He agreed with other speakers that it would be most difficult to give detailed replies on certain items in the proposed questionnaire, but he was sure his Government would do everything it could to supply the Agency with satisfactory answers.
68. Mr. BRÁZDA (Czechoslovakia) thought it was very important that any current fellowship offers valid for 1958 should be taken up at once. That would be feasible only on condition that all possible information about fellowships was obtained, as was proposed in the memorandum and suggested during the discussion in the Board.

69. In his view, the Board should take the following steps. It should instruct the Secretariat to obtain full details of the training facilities already offered, and communicate them without delay to all Member States. The Secretariat should further attempt to draw upon wide experience of training programmes gained by the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) and use it in solving its own problems. It should also inquire about expert training which Member States intended to carry out in the near future. Finally, the Secretariat should consider regulations to govern the allocation of fellowships made available through the Agency.

70. Mr. WERSHOF (Canada) said he would hesitate at that time to enter into a discussion of such difficult problems as the exchange of scientists, a question dealt with in the Preparatory Commission's report^{14/}, but that seemed a very different matter from the provision of fellowships, whether they were granted out of the \$250,000 fund or were directly offered by Governments or individuals for allocation through the Agency.

71. In his view, two kinds of fellowship programmes were under discussion - the Agency's own programme to be financed from the \$250,000 fund, and offers of fellowships made by Governments. If the further question of the exchange of scientists were raised in the Board, that would add to the difficulty of an already complicated discussion.

72. He recognized that many of the Board's difficulties arose from the need to act quickly. Although it was perhaps theoretically preferable, instead of acting immediately, to study Agency and governmental fellowship arrangements at some length, the Board could not, unfortunately, allow itself that indulgence if, as was eminently desirable, the Agency's practical programme was to be inaugurated in the immediate future.

^{14/} See paragraphs 69-79 of the Report of the Preparatory Commission of the IAEA (GOV/1).

73. He thought that answers to the proposed questionnaire could not be received, or at least fully analysed, before the autumn of 1958, so that then it would be of no great assistance in preparing the 1958 programme.

74. In his opinion, the Board should make a clear distinction between two kinds of fellowship programmes. The provision by Governments of fellowships which they expected the Agency to pay for was neither a contribution in money nor, strictly speaking, a fellowship offer. Although it might be useful to know of such possibilities, they did not really constitute offers and should not be considered under the present agenda item.

75. The convertibility of money contributions gave rise to complications. He did not wish to suggest at present that restrictions should be applied in regard to the currencies in which contributions could be made to the General Fund. However, it might eventually be found necessary to have certain rules, because if many contributions were made in non-convertible currencies, the Agency would find itself holding large funds which could be spent only in the countries making the offers. Those funds might possibly be very useful, but the result would be to restrict the scope of the Agency's programmes, and he personally thought it would be a great deal better to have a total of \$250,000 which could be used anywhere. Those considerations could, however, be left aside for the moment; the overriding need now was to start work as soon as possible on the provision of fellowships. Substantial cash offers had already been made and a large number of immediately available fellowships offered. Even if the Secretariat had to drop certain procedural desiderata it should try to find out at once how such facilities could be best employed.

76. In that connexion the Secretariat, with guidance from the Board, would have to decide what academic standards and language qualifications should be applied, whether individuals should be encouraged to apply direct or whether they should be placed through government services, and a whole series of other questions. As the matter was so urgent he thought the Board would have to delegate much policy responsibility to the Secretariat.

77. He supported the suggestion of the Governor from the Union of South Africa that the Secretariat should consult with Governors present in Vienna between the Board's series of meetings.
78. Many international and national organizations had a wide experience of **fellowship programmes**. Until the Agency had its own experts, the Director General might consider the possibility of borrowing experts from the Technical Assistance Board (TAB) or UNESCO for the purpose of setting the 1958 programme in motion and advising on longer-term programmes.
79. The Board must at all costs avoid concluding the discussion without taking a formal decision that would empower the Secretariat to use the money already available immediately and take up the fellowship offers so far notified.
80. Mr. SURJOTJONDRO (Indonesia) expressed deep satisfaction and gratitude, as a representative of a less-developed country, for the offers of contributions and fellowships made by various Governors.
81. He agreed with other Governors that a clear distinction should be made between fellowships provided by the Agency in accordance with Resolution C adopted by the General Conference and fellowships offered by individual Members.
82. He felt there was some contradiction between paragraph 73 of the Preparatory Commission's report and the General Conference resolution which called on all Members to make voluntary contributions to the General Fund to finance the fellowship programme. He felt that the observation made on that subject by the Governor from the United Kingdom^{15/}, if taken to its logical conclusion, would mean that there would be two categories of voluntary contributors - the more and the less willing.
83. He joined various other Governors in suggesting that the questionnaire outlined in paragraph 7 of the Secretariat memorandum should be worked out more fully. He pointed out that, in order to carry out their atomic energy programmes, less-advanced

^{15/} See above, paragraph 23.

countries would need not only scientists and experts but also mechanics and technicians. That point was mentioned incidentally in paragraph (g) of the questionnaire, but he felt it should receive greater prominence.

84. The processing of applications constituted a serious problem in administering a fellowship programme. Enthusiasm might well cool down if it took too long to answer an application.

85. As soon as full particulars of the available fellowships were to hand, his Government would be happy to answer any questions about the number of candidates it would like to have placed.

86. Mr. AHMAD (Pakistan) expressed appreciation of the offers made by the Governors from the United States of America, the United Kingdom, the Soviet Union and Romania, and the implied offers other Governors had made. That appreciation was all the keener for the assurance from the Governor from the United States that his offer would be additional to all existing United States aid programmes; on the other hand, it had been somewhat clouded by the conditions attached to some of the other offers. He hoped the difficulties could be overcome, however, and that the General Fund would be able to provide the resources needed.

87. He agreed it was desirable that contributions should be made in convertible currencies so as to guarantee an assured and continuous programme of training assistance; but all offers, including fellowships in the offering country's own institutions, were of course welcome, even though the opportunities so provided might be more limited in some cases. He also agreed it was essential to ensure that a fellowship training programme would be in operation before the end of 1958. In that connexion, although it would be unnecessary to await replies to the very detailed questionnaire the Secretariat had in mind, enough information should be obtained to enable the Agency to match offers against requests. If the requests were for training in basic sciences, it would probably not be difficult to satisfy them because the necessary facilities would be available at

almost any university; but applications from countries which could themselves provide training in basic sciences might ask for training in very specialized aspects of radioisotope and reactor technology, and would be more difficult to satisfy.

88. The specialized training given should be such that, on their return home, trainees should be fully capable of carrying out programmes; it should be at the same level, without any distinction, as that provided for nationals of the offering countries.

89. As the Governor from Indonesia had just said, arrangements for processing applications should be as simple as possible. An excessively complex administrative process would waste time, and might mean that full advantage could not be taken of offers because of the need to find replacements for candidates who dropped out because processing took too long.

90. Mr. PULLEY (Australia) said his Government believed the fellowship programme merited high priority and it was currently considering the form its own participation should take. It would no doubt be stimulated by the offers that had been made and by the discussion in the Board of Governors.

91. Pointing out that it was difficult to secure answers until the questions had been asked, he supported the Governor from the Union of South Africa in suggesting that the Secretariat should be requested to refine the questionnaire in consultation with those Governors who were permanently resident in Vienna, so that it could be circulated as soon as possible.

92. Mr. DOLLINGER (Representative of the Secretary-General of the United Nations) drew attention to the meeting, the first of its kind for two years, to be held in Geneva in June 1958 by the Technical Working Group on Fellowships of the Administrative Committee on Co-ordination (ACC). The meeting would deal with the administrative and practical aspects of fellowships. The experience acquired by the United Nations and the specialized agencies would be pooled and fully discussed. The agenda would include such matters as programming of fellowships, procedures for

selecting applicants, statistical and other reporting, evaluation, and various financial questions, such as the specific difficulties experienced by various organizations with regard to travel expenses, sickness insurance and other special expenditure. He suggested that the Agency might wish to be represented at that meeting.

93. In reply to the suggestion that had been made by the Governor from Canada ^{16/}, he said that the United Nations would be pleased to provide information on its own experience; and on the machinery which had been devised for fellowship administration. Some staff members of the United Nations and the specialized agencies had been working on such problems for many years, and he felt that it might be useful to arrange for talks between them and the Secretariat of the Agency.

94. Mr. MIGULIN (Deputy Director General for Training and Information) was glad that the Secretariat memorandum had proved useful. The valuable comments and suggestions made by Governors had already given the Secretariat a basis on which to make a start with the Agency's fellowship programme.

95. In reply to a question that had been put by the Governor from Turkey ^{17/}, he pointed out that paragraph 19 (b) of the Preparatory Commission's report already set forth the guiding principle on which the Agency's arrangements for carrying out the fellowship programme would have to be made, and that a list of countries that had offered fellowships appeared in Annex B, paragraph 4, of the draft report to the General Assembly of the United Nations during its twelfth session ^{18/}; to that list should, of course, be added the Members that had just made further offers.

^{16/} See above, paragraph 78.

^{17/} See above, paragraphs 20 and 21.

^{18/} GOV/38/Rev.1. (The report as adopted (CC(II)/INF/11) did not contain Annex B of the draft).

96. He agreed that it had never been intended that a full answer would have to be given to every question in the questionnaire mentioned in paragraph 7 of the Secretariat memorandum; as paragraph 8 indicated, replies to the essential questions would give the Secretariat sufficient information to draw up the initial programme.

97. In addition, the offers just made by the Governors from the United States of America, the United Kingdom, the Soviet Union and Romania had themselves provided the Secretariat with much useful information.

98. In that connexion, he felt it necessary to comment on the opinion expressed by the Governor from Indonesia that the offers should be carefully examined and Members informed of them before requests could be expected to arrive. In fact, he believed that any country that had a definite shortage of experts would say so at once; its request could then be matched by an offer of a fellowship by another country. He thought it would be unfair and time-wasting to wait until the offers had been circulated before dealing with requests. The next academic year in most countries started in autumn 1958, and action must be taken quickly enough to allow candidates to be sent by that time to countries prepared to receive them.

99. He was very grateful to the Governor from the United Kingdom for the readiness expressed to accept students in practically any branch of study; it was well known that the standard of education in the United Kingdom was very high. The Governor from the Soviet Union had made valuable suggestions about curricula and teaching material. They would be taken fully into account, particularly when the time came to draft textbooks and manuals for use in connexion with the atomic energy programmes of individual countries.

100. He wished once more to point out that - although the Agency now had a number of offers - the initial fellowship programme could not be drawn up until requests had been received.

101. With regard to the view of the Governor from Canada that the exchange of scientists should be dealt with separately, he felt that that might lead to psychological difficulties and that the entire programme would be better carried out as a single operation.

102. The information the representative of the Secretary-General had offered to make available about the procedures followed by the United Nations and specialized agencies should be utilized by the Agency to the fullest possible extent.

103. Mr. JOLIES (Deputy Director General for Administration, Liaison and Secretariat) observed that some clear answers had been given to the financial and administrative questions he had put at the beginning of the discussion. He now understood that it was the Board's wish that voluntary contributions should be made in money, that they should be unconditional and that they should be paid, if possible, in a convertible currency. He presumed that the Secretariat should now send a circular to Member States soliciting contributions to the General Fund, and that, although it had been suggested that the General Conference resolution on voluntary contributions had not really intended to invite all Members to make such contributions, the circular should in fact be sent to all Members; any other arrangement would be extremely difficult for the Secretariat. The circular might be more effective if it did not merely solicit contributions but also included particulars of the voluntary contributions that had already been pledged.

104. In that connexion, he presumed that it would be in order for the circular (and indeed any other circulars) to be addressed to the Ministers of Foreign Affairs of Member States but sent to the Governors from those States that were represented on the Board.

105. He agreed with the Deputy Director General for Training and Information and the representative of the Secretary-General of the United Nations that the Agency should profit from the experience of the United Nations and the specialized agencies, both through direct contacts and through representation in the Technical Working Group on Fellowships of the ACC.

106. The DIRECTOR GENERAL informed the Board that an offer had been received from Yugoslavia too late to be circulated. Five fellowships per year of six months each, in chemistry or physics at the nuclear institutions in Yugoslavia were offered. They included the cost of training, housing and subsistence.

107. With regard to what the Governor from Canada had said about experience gained by other organizations, he said he intended to arrange for talks between the Secretariats of UNESCO and of the Agency.

108. A memorandum had already been sent to a number of Governments inviting them to propose candidates for fellowships, so that the Agency could build up a panel of competent candidates for the subsequent award of fellowships.

109. It was important to decide what types of training should be emphasized under the fellowship programme. There was a tendency to talk in broad terms about nuclear training in general, but in practice it was necessary to particularize the training required and to determine where the emphasis should be placed for the near future. The recipient country itself, of course, had to decide in which branches it required trained experts, but he felt that - particularly in the part of the fellowship programme to be financed out of the Agency's own resources - the Agency should exert such influence as it could to encourage training in the use of radioisotopes and radiation sources in medical diagnosis and treatment where early and tangible results were most likely. Radioisotopes were readily available at known prices, and the main difficulty in extending their use was the shortage of trained personnel. Personnel could, however, be trained comparatively quickly and cheaply, and the training could rapidly be applied in a way which would be particularly valuable to humanity. On the other hand, the training of reactor specialists would take much longer, would cost more, and be less immediately rewarding.

110. Mr. SURJOTJONDRO (Indonesia) believed that he had been misunderstood by the Deputy Director General for Training and Information; he wished to make it clear, therefore, that his Government would be ready to consider putting forward candidates for the fellowship programme as soon as sufficient detailed information, including processing data, was available regarding the possibilities of the fellowships offered.

111. The CHAIRMAN thought that, with regard to the item as a whole, the Board would wish to take up the suggestion of the Governor from India^{19/} and note with satisfaction the voluntary contributions and offers of fellowships and other assistance that had been announced, or indicated in general terms, by various Governors.

112. With regard to part (b) of the item, the Secretariat had confirmed that it now had sufficient guidance to proceed with its work on the initial programme so far as offers were concerned. The Board might wish to adopt the suggestion of the Governors from the Soviet Union, the Union of South Africa and (by implication) of Turkey, that the Secretariat should be recommended to make a clear distinction between the immediate programme, the programme for 1959 and the long-term programme. As the Deputy Director General for Training and Information had said, the information required for the immediate programme was either already to hand or comparatively simple to collect, and the Board might express the hope that action would be taken to proceed with that programme as the Agency's resources permitted. The necessary data for the long-term programme might be got by obtaining information from Member Governments about available facilities and the demand for places under fellowship schemes. As to the methods of obtaining such information, the Secretariat might consult members of the Board permanently represented in Vienna, as suggested by the Governor from the Union of South Africa. The Secretariat could itself later determine whether such informal consultations had proved adequate; if not, the suggestion to set up a formal committee of the Board might be considered further.

^{19/} See above, paragraph 61.